Monthly Meeting - 1-18-2018

STATE OF NEW YORK
PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

MEETING OF THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

Thursday, January 18, 2018
10:30 a.m.
Three Empire State Plaza
Agency Building 3, 19th Floor
Albany, New York

COMMISSIONERS:

JOHN B. RHODES, Chair GREGG C. SAYRE DIANE X. BURMAN JAMES S. ALESI

- 1 Monthly Meeting 1-18-2018
- 2 CHAIRMAN RHODES: Good morning.
- 3 I'd like to call this session -- this
- 4 first session of 2018, of the Public Service Commission
- 5 to order.
- 6 Secretary Burgess, are there any changes
- 7 to the final agenda?
- 8 SECRETARY BURGESS: Good morning, Chair
- 9 and Commissioners.
- There's one change to the final agenda.
- It's a new item. Item 461, which is case 16-W-0259,
- 12 proceeding on the motion of the Commission as to the
- 13 rates, charges, rules and regulations of New York
- 14 American Water Company comma Inc., for water service.
- 15 CHAIRMAN RHODES: Thank you, very much.
- 16 With that, we'll proceed to the regular
- 17 agenda. The first -- the first item for discussion is
- 18 item 201, case 14-M-0224, which is the petition by Good
- 19 Energy to create a community-choice aggregation
- 20 program, presented by Kelly Strait. Utility Analyst,
- 21 Bruce Al -- Bruce Alch, Chief Retail Access and
- 22 Economic Development and Ted Kelly, Assistant Counsel
- 23 are available for questions.
- 24 Kelly, please begin.
- MS. STRAIT: Good morning, Chair Rhodes

- 1 Monthly Meeting 1-18-2018
- 2 and Commissioners.
- 3 Item 201 addresses a petition filed by
- 4 Good Energy, to serve as a community-choice aggregation
- 5 administrator, for several municipalities in New York
- 6 State. The filings by Good Energy include a master
- 7 implementation plan, a generic data-protection --
- 8 protection plan and certifications of municipal
- 9 authorizations, to form a CCA.
- By way of background, on April 21st,
- 11 2016, the Commission established the framework for the
- development of CCA programs, which aims to increase
- 13 consumer choice and participation, while also
- 14 supporting local energy planning and deployment of
- 15 distributed energy resources. In the CCA program, one
- or more municipalities aggregates the load of its
- 17 residents and small businesses on an opt-out basis and
- 18 procures energy and potentially DER services, on their
- 19 behalf. The CCA framework order authorize interested
- 20 municipalities on their own, or through their selected
- 21 CCA administrator, to make a series of filings, as has
- 22 been done by Good Energy, for Commission consideration
- 23 to initiate a CCA program.
- 24 This -- the frame -- the CCA framework
- 25 order required that the implementation plan include a

- 1 Monthly Meeting 1-18-2018
- 2 description of the plan and its goals, a public-
- 3 outreach plan, drafts of written communications with
- 4 its residents, including an opt-out letter, contact
- 5 information for a CCA liaison to respond to questions
- 6 or concerns by potential CCA customers and
- 7 identification of at least one local official or agency
- 8 in each municipality that residents may contact with
- 9 questions or comments.
- 10 The CCA administrator is also required
- 11 to file updates and supplements to the implementation
- 12 plan as appropriate, including final versions of
- 13 customer opt-out letters that provide details on
- 14 program contracts.
- 15 After review, Staff finds that Good
- 16 Energy's proposed CCA program complies with the
- 17 Commission's framework order and meets the general
- 18 requirements laid out in that framework order.
- 19 However, some minor revisions to their implementation
- 20 plan and data-protect -- protection plan are needed.
- To be consistent with the Mega order,
- 22 Good Energy should remove the customer-account number
- 23 from its definition of customer contact information, in
- 24 both its implementation plan and data-protection plan
- 25 and should ensure that its outreach and education

- 1 Monthly Meeting 1-18-2018
- 2 period will take place over no less than a two-month
- 3 period and that the opt-out period will last at least
- 4 thirty days and cannot begin until the outreach and
- 5 education period ends.
- 6 Lastly, Good Energy will need to update
- 7 their implementation plan to confirm that limited
- 8 English-proficiency consumers will continue to receive
- 9 translation services throughout the life of the CCA
- 10 program. These revisions can be provided in a
- 11 compliance filing.
- 12 That concludes my presentation. I am
- 13 available for questions.
- 14 Thank you.
- 15 CHAIRMAN RHODES: Thank you, much --
- 16 very much, Kelly.
- I -- I welcome this item. I welcome --
- 18 excuse me.
- 19 I'm back -- I'm on the mic now.
- 20 I -- I welcome this item. I welcome
- 21 that continued deployment of community-choice
- 22 aggregation approaches in the state are occurring,
- 23 providing communities in New York State greater control
- 24 over and savings opportunity in their energy choices.
- I welcome the fact that this item

- 1 Monthly Meeting 1-18-2018
- 2 adheres to the model established in prior -- in the two
- 3 prior CCA orders. And I welcome the -- the renewable
- 4 component in this -- in this proposal.
- 5 I will vote to approve.
- 6 Commissioner Sayre?
- 7 COMMISSIONER SAYRE: The CCA process is
- 8 really almost becoming routine and I'm very glad to see
- 9 that.
- 10 I'm happy to see that CCAs are starting
- 11 to thrive in New York. They provide increased customer
- 12 choice and customer savings and frequently include some
- 13 combination, as this one does, of clean energy and
- 14 distributed energy resources.
- That's all in the public interest and I
- 16 support this item.
- 17 CHAIRMAN RHODES: Thank you.
- Commissioner Burman?
- 19 COMMISSIONER BURMAN: Thank you.
- I know that we approved the statewide
- 21 framework in April of 2016. At that time I dissented
- 22 because we were starting the pilot and we had not yet
- 23 had any lessons learned from the pilot because we were
- 24 starting it, to look to incorporate into the statewide
- 25 program.

- 1 Monthly Meeting 1-18-2018
- 2 Since that time, there have been a
- 3 number of pivotal points in examining what is happening
- 4 with the pilot. We have approved the Mega Program and
- 5 we've been incrementally looking at potential changes
- 6 to that.
- 7 I still am very laser focused on fully
- 8 examining the pilot, things that can be done positively
- 9 to continue to improve, not only that pilot but overall
- 10 statewide and incorporate that. I do believe that
- 11 there has been a lot of engagement with stakeholders in
- doing that and that has been successful in making
- 13 improvements on stand-alone applications, not only in
- 14 Mega, but in Good Energy.
- 15 However, I do believe that we do need to
- 16 have a more holistic approach and a more -- approach
- 17 that comes before the Commission, to do that.
- 18 Couple of questions that I have, related
- 19 to that, Kelly. I do know that you were one of the
- 20 stakeholders involved on the recent filing this week
- 21 with the CCA sub-working group filing, with the CCAC.
- 22 voluntary program. And I'm wondering, with that report
- 23 that was filed, how is that incorporated into this
- 24 document, if at all, or how will it be incorporated,
- 25 some of those recommendations?

- 1 Monthly Meeting 1-18-2018
- MS. STRAIT: So, I don't think the
- 3 report's going to be incorporated into this plan right
- 4 now. A lot of it is recommendations going forward,
- 5 with the implementation of -- or the integration of the
- 6 community DG element. Things like consolidated
- 7 billing, that need to be done.
- 8 If those issues can be resolved, then
- 9 Good Energy would be able to adopt them, moving
- 10 forward.
- 11 COMMISSIONER BURMAN: Well, one of the
- 12 concerns that I have is that there a number of working
- 13 groups and sub-groups that have been moving along.
- 14 Some of them are moving along very successfully, some
- of them not so successfully and some of them are
- operating not necessarily in tandem with each other.
- 17 And throughout the -- my tenure on the
- 18 Commission, I have been concerned about working groups,
- 19 advisory groups and the councils and when they are
- 20 moving along, how that matches up to working together
- 21 and also what those advisory roles are, that then are
- 22 making recommendations that perhaps need to come back
- 23 to the Commission and have weigh-in on that.
- So, to the extent that this item is
- 25 before us and a report gets issued, you know, two days

- 1 Monthly Meeting 1-18-2018
- 2 before, that frankly has a lot of information in it,
- 3 that might be helpful to making this better, you know,
- 4 is information that, you know, I -- but I also will
- 5 recognize that one of the reasons that I have dissented
- on many of the community-choice aggregation items is
- 7 because of my concern that the devils are in -- the
- 8 devil is in the details and, you know, even as this
- 9 report that I did not have a lot of time to look at,
- 10 but it even showcases some of the issues that I had
- 11 from the very beginning.
- 12 Out of the seven states that have done
- 13 community-choice aggregation, New York is the only
- 14 state that has done this outside of the legislative
- 15 process. Out of all of the stakeholders, in this case,
- 16 the small group of stakeholders in this sub-group,
- 17 there is a lot of disagreement and so, to the degree
- 18 that there is need to be significant discussion and to
- 19 the extent that the Commission itself, that is weighing
- 20 in heavily on things that will impact customers, we
- 21 need to be very, very much engaged on and not, you
- 22 know, coming up short on our obligation to the
- 23 customers in this case.
- 24 So for me, I can support this item, but
- 25 I need to be very cautious on -- and -- and be very

- 1 Monthly Meeting 1-18-2018
- 2 public on my concern on the need to bring back to the
- 3 Commission, things that have policy considerations and
- 4 reports that go out, that are directly connected to
- 5 items that the Commission will be voting on. And to
- 6 the extent that this report from the CCAC., which is
- 7 one sub-group of many others, and this -- the CCAC. is
- 8 an advisory group, I did raise it when -- in -- in my
- 9 disagreement when it was formed under an order, that I
- 10 had concern with it. So, I just raise it as an issue,
- 11 that it does need to come back to the Commission,
- 12 especially because it's out there and that -- to the
- 13 extent that many items in that are not necessarily
- 14 completely agreed to by the stakeholders, but also
- 15 there are many items in that, that deal with funding as
- 16 well as also potentially needing some policy actions,
- 17 through legislative actions, or frankly, other agencies
- 18 may need to weigh-in also. I want to be cognizant of
- 19 that.
- So, that being said, that's why I raised
- 21 that issue.
- I also do note that in that sub-group,
- 23 there were -- there were -- there was not a sole
- 24 consumer advocate, UIU or other advocate in that group.
- 25 So, I do want to raise that as an issue, as well as

- 1 Monthly Meeting 1-18-2018
- 2 there was some talk of commercial customers in there as
- 3 well.
- 4 One of the things in here, talks about
- 5 low-income customers and the compliance filing. And to
- 6 the extent that I do want to raise that there is still
- 7 an ongoing distinction between low-income -- how we're
- 8 treating low-income customers for ESCOS, different for
- 9 if you're in a CCA versus in a stand-alone ESCO -- I --
- 10 I don't know if that's the right phrasing.
- 11 Could you just distinguish that, Bruce?
- 12 I'm not disputing it. I just want to make clear, so --
- in case there's any discrepancy later.
- 14 MR. ALCH: Okay. I -- so, as described
- in the -- in the draft order, the -- the obligation to
- 16 serve low-income customers still has the same
- 17 requirements, that you have to have a guaranteed
- 18 savings and the requisite reporting of demonstration of
- 19 those savings, at a year-end basis.
- 20 COMMISSIONER BURMAN: Right.
- 21 And -- and the issues as to what is a
- 22 guaranteed savings, are still -- some of that is still
- 23 being --.
- 24 MR. ALCH: Well, it's -- it's the same
- 25 statements. That hasn't changed, but it's at -- no

- 1 Monthly Meeting 1-18-2018
- 2 worse than the default utility.
- 3 COMMISSIONER BURMAN: Okay.
- 4 MR. ALCH: So --.
- 5 COMMISSIONER BURMAN: All right. Thank
- 6 you.
- 7 And then the other issue is on the
- 8 buyer's group and that is different from before. This
- 9 is a new concept in Good Energy in their implementation
- 10 plan and we've refined that?
- 11 MR. KELLY: I -- I think it's --
- 12 it's somewhat similar to the Mega model, but with --
- 13 COMMISSIONER BURMAN: Yeah.
- 14 MR. KELLY: -- some -- some minor
- 15 distinctions, based just how on -- on Good Energy has
- 16 operated in other states and is interested in
- 17 operating. Where I think Good Energy explicitly
- 18 provides a little more flexibility for municipalities
- 19 to decide who they want to partner with, Mega was open
- 20 to that as well, but kind of focused on the idea of
- 21 buyer's groups based on utility-service territories and
- 22 -- and -- and utility zone -- sub-zones, whereas Good
- 23 Energy is -- is -- kind of has a more-flexible
- 24 interpretation of what a buyer's group is. That's kind
- 25 of a -- a voluntary municipal -- municipal choice in

- 1 Monthly Meeting 1-18-2018
- 2 which other municipalities it wants to join with.
- 3 COMMISSIONER BURMAN: Okay. And I -- I
- 4 do thank you. I know that you've been working very
- 5 hard.
- And Kelly, I know that, especially
- 7 you've been drilling down a lot on a lot of these
- 8 issues.
- 9 Again, I do want to reiterate, I will be
- 10 voting for this item, but I am being very cognizant of
- 11 the fact of the need for us to look carefully, now that
- 12 the pilots are coming on their renewal time. It is
- 13 time for us to be very cognizant of what that is, have
- 14 a very good process in looking at that and engaging
- 15 very directly on successes and also for some potential
- 16 issues that may be there, as well as improvements and
- 17 also, looking at what this may mean across the board
- 18 and again, some of the policy considerations that need
- 19 to come to the Commission as a whole.
- Thank you.
- 21 CHAIRMAN RHODES: Thank you, very much.
- 22 Commissioner Alesi?
- COMMISSIONER ALESI: Thank you.
- Good morning.
- I'm going to be supporting this effort.

- 1 Monthly Meeting 1-18-2018
- 2 I -- I embrace it fully. I think it complies with the
- 3 ideas and the efforts to provide energy and service at
- 4 lower costs.
- 5 I'm particularly intrigued by the fact
- 6 that it's available to non-residential small
- 7 businesses. I think that's very important. We
- 8 shouldn't lose sight of that fact in conjunction with
- 9 what we're trying to achieve here overall in New York
- 10 State, in bolstering our business climate.
- 11 And the fact that it does provide what
- 12 appears to be some kind of protective -- protection to
- 13 -- an opportunity to low-income people is also
- 14 appealing to me.
- So, I'll be supporting this, Mr.
- 16 Chairman.
- 17 CHAIRMAN RHODES: Thank you, very much.
- 18 I will now proceed to call for a vote on
- 19 item 201.
- 20 My vote is in favor of the
- 21 recommendation to approve Good Energy, LP's community-
- 22 choice aggregation program implementation plan and
- 23 data-protection plan as described.
- 24 Commissioner Sayre, how do you vote?
- 25 COMMISSIONER SAYRE: Aye.

- 1 Monthly Meeting 1-18-2018
- 2 CHAIRMAN RHODES: Commissioner Burman,
- 3 how do you vote?
- 4 COMMISSIONER BURMAN: Yes.
- 5 CHAIRMAN RHODES: Commissioner Alesi,
- 6 how do you vote?
- 7 COMMISSIONER ALESI: I vote yes.
- 8 CHAIRMAN RHODES: The item is approved
- 9 and the recommendation is adopted.
- 10 We'll now move to the second item for
- 11 discussion. Item 301, case 15-E-0751, which is the
- 12 value of distributed-energy resources, Tranche Four
- 13 proposal, presented by Ted Kelly, Assistant Counsel.
- 14 Ted, please begin.
- MR. KELLY: Thank you.
- Good morning, Chair and Commissioners.
- The value of distributed-energy
- 18 resources, or VDER, the Value of DER, it's got several
- 19 names, order that the Commission issued last March,
- 20 directed the transition of compensation for distributed
- 21 generation, from net-metering to the new value stack.
- 22 methodology.
- 23 Several transitional mechanisms were in
- 24 that order. On-site mass-market customers, such as
- 25 roof-top solar, continue to receive net-metering for

- 1 Monthly Meeting 1-18-2018
- 2 all projects built before -- until January 1st, 2020.
- 3 Mass-market customers and that's
- 4 residential customers as well as small businesses,
- 5 participating in community-distributed generation
- 6 projects, community solar for example, receive a
- 7 market-transition credit, or MTC on top of the value
- 8 stack. The MTC was design -- was designed based on
- 9 net-metering compensation, so that the first group of
- 10 projects in Tranche One, would receive an MTC that was
- 11 designed to, coupled with the value stack, provide
- 12 compensation equal to NEM compensation. The second
- 13 group of projects, or Tranche Two, received an MTC
- 14 designed to provide compensation equal to ninety-five
- 15 percent of NEM compensation. And the third group of
- 16 projects, Tranche Three, received an MTC to provide --
- 17 designed to provide ninety percent.
- To manage potential impacts on non-
- 19 participating ratepayers, buy-utility capacity limits
- 20 were applied to each tranche of the MTC in each
- 21 utility, with a notification to the cust -- to the
- 22 Commission, by the utility, when 85 percent of the
- 23 total-capacity allocations for all tranches had been
- 24 reached.
- No utility has yet reached the

- 1 Monthly Meeting 1-18-2018
- 2 notification level for on-site, roof-top projects.
- 3 However, for the CBG projects, the tranches, O&R
- 4 reached the eighty-five percent level and submitted its
- 5 notification letter in the summer and Central Hudson
- 6 did so in November.
- 7 After submitting their letters, both O&R
- 8 and Central Hudson reached and exceeded the Tranche
- 9 Three capacity limit. Consistent with the March order,
- 10 the utilities continued placing projects in Tranche
- 11 Three.
- 12 After receiving the let -- the
- 13 notification letter, Staff put out a White Paper in
- 14 August, that contained options and recommendations for
- 15 moving beyond Tranche Three. The White Paper
- 16 recommended that a fourth tranche be created, with a
- 17 reduced market-transition credit and with a capacity
- 18 level similar to Tranche Three. The White Paper
- 19 discussed options for setting the market-transition
- 20 credit level, including a further percentage decline,
- 21 administratively set by the Commission, that ultimately
- 22 recommended that an auction process be used.
- 23 A number of comments and reply comments
- 24 were received on the White Paper. All comments
- 25 supported the development of Tranche Four.

1 Monthly Meeting - 1-18-2018 2 While many commenters agreed that 3 auction -- that auctions and some similar competitive 4 procurement mechanisms are often effective in general, all commenters agreed that an auction should not be 5 used in this case because given the relatively small 6 7 size of the proposed Tranche Four, the costs and risk -8 - risks associated with the auction, would overwhelm any benefits. Instead, the commenters recommended that 9 Tranche Four MTC be set -- administratively set, either 10 based on a further five-percent decline, or based on an 11 12 -- an analysis of what was needed for further market 13 activity. 14 The draft order before you today 15 recommends that Tranche Four be created and utilities 16 which have reached, or which are close to reaching Tranche Three capacity, specifically O&R, Central 17 Hudson and NYSEG, that Tranche Three be immediately 18 19 closed in O&R and Central Hudson and that Tranche Three 20 immediate -- be immediately closed when it reaches 2.1 capacity in NYSEG, where it's relatively close to being 22 full, but is not yet full. 23 Based on an analysis conducted by 24 NYSERDA and Staff, the draft order establishes a 25 Tranche Four MTC in O&R, which is designed to provide

- 1 Monthly Meeting 1-18-2018
- 2 75 percent of NEM compensation, for a 15 percent total
- 3 reduction in compensation from Tranche Three. Due to
- 4 the lower initial MTCs in Central Hudson and NYSEG and
- 5 based on the same analysis, the draft order establishes
- 6 a Tranche Four MTC in those utilities, designed to
- 7 provide 85 percent of NEM compensation, for a five
- 8 percent total reduction in compensation from Tranche
- 9 Three.
- 10 The capacity allocations for Tranche
- 11 Four in each utility, are based on Tranche Three,
- 12 rounded up to account for the Commission's
- 13 consideration of an increase in project-size limit to
- 14 five megawatts.
- The Tranche Four MTCs and capacity
- 16 allocations in the draft order, are designed to
- 17 continue to animate the market, while causing minimal
- 18 incremental impact to non-participating ratepayers.
- 19 This will also encourage developers to find and build
- 20 projects in the locations that have the highest values
- 21 and lowest costs, consistent with the goals and
- 22 principles of REV.
- To avoid further impacts on a focused
- 24 group of ratepayers, in particular, the -- the
- 25 residential ratepayers in the relatively small utility

- 1 Monthly Meeting 1-18-2018
- 2 territories of O&R and Central Hudson, the Tranche Four
- 3 all -- capacity allocations are hard caps, such that
- 4 once they are reached, in a utility territory, no
- 5 further market-transition credit will be available for
- 6 new projects.
- 7 So that the market is not subjected to
- 8 unreasonable uncertainty or delay, the order directs
- 9 Staff to immediately begin working with stakeholders
- 10 and NYSERDA, to develop a proposal for compensation,
- 11 once Tranche Four has been filled in a territory, which
- 12 should specifically consider statewide funding
- 13 mechanisms, such that the impact of any further
- 14 projects isn't -- is not focused on those small groups
- of ratepayers.
- Thank you and I'm available for
- 17 questions.
- 18 CHAIRMAN RHODES: Thank you, Ted.
- I -- I'll begin with my remarks.
- 20 I welcome this item. I find that it
- 21 represents a thoughtful outcome, preserving our
- 22 interest in advancing compensation for distributed-
- 23 energy resources, including solar. Basing that
- 24 compensation on value, I find that it gives developers
- 25 and customers clarity to work with and preserves the

- 1 Monthly Meeting 1-18-2018
- 2 ability -- their ability to deploy this -- this
- 3 resource, solar, and I find that it does so, while
- 4 minimizing the cost to ratepayers.
- 5 I will vote to approve.
- 6 Commissioner Sayer?
- 7 COMMISSIONER SAYRE: I'm in agreement
- 8 with the Chair's comments.
- 9 This item required a hard look to
- 10 balance the public interest in increasing and
- 11 supporting new clean-energy resources, against the
- incremental burden of these programs on non-
- 13 participating customers. I think this item strikes an
- 14 appropriate balance.
- 15 It does indeed provide for a modest
- 16 increase in overall clean energy support, but the
- 17 alternative of essentially shutting down future CDG
- 18 projects in Central Hudson's and O&R's territories was
- 19 simply one that I couldn't support.
- 20 The second choice in this item was a
- 21 good deal easier. Once we decided to go ahead with an
- 22 additional tranche, as the Chair said and -- and as Ted
- 23 said, it was clear from the comments, that requiring a
- 24 reverse auction for the available support, would set up
- 25 an unwieldy and expensive process, for a relatively

- 1 Monthly Meeting 1-18-2018
- 2 small area and by itself, might have severely
- 3 discouraged new project development.
- So, this item sets the approach -- the
- 5 -- the support amount administratively and I think it
- 6 strikes a good balance there.
- 7 CHAIRMAN RHODES: Thank you.
- 8 Commissioner Burman?
- 9 COMMISSIONER BURMAN: So, can you just
- 10 explain, in layman's terms, Tranche Three, what happens
- 11 after it gets filled?
- MR. KELLY: Sure.
- 13 So, under the terms of the March order,
- 14 we're -- when Tranche Three got filled, projects
- 15 continued to be placed in to Tranche Three. It
- 16 essentially was allowed to overflow, until the
- 17 Commission took further action, which this order --
- 18 COMMISSIONER BURMAN: Correct.
- 19 MR. KELLY: -- is that further action.
- 20 COMMISSIONER BURMAN: Right.
- 21 And now, what's going to happen after
- 22 this, if -- if this Commission votes for this?
- MR. KELLY: So, Tranche -- so, any new
- 24 projects, which have not yet met the milestone to be
- 25 placed in Tranche Three, but which subsequently meet

- 1 Monthly Meeting 1-18-2018
- 2 the milestone, will be placed in to Tranche Four.
- Once Tranche Four is filled up, in a
- 4 given utility, there will be no MTC available to any
- 5 new projects, unless and until a new decision is made
- 6 on the Commission. For example, on the Staff's
- 7 proposal for a statewide funding mechanism.
- 8 COMMISSIONER BURMAN: Has there been any
- 9 analysis on what that cost-shifting may be?
- MR. KELLY: So, the -- the cost-
- 11 shifting of Tranche Four is relatively minimal. It's,
- 12 you know, it's an -- it's -- the estimates are very --
- 13 contain a lot of assumptions, but under a third of a
- 14 percent and likely under a quarter of a percent.
- 15 COMMISSIONER BURMAN: And what about if
- 16 we go beyond that?
- MR. KELLY: Well, I'm not sure I
- 18 understand.
- 19 I -- it would depend how we went beyond
- 20 it. Certainly, it, you know --
- 21 COMMISSIONER BURMAN: Right.
- MR. KELLY: -- it -- on what level we
- 23 went --
- 24 COMMISSIONER BURMAN: Right.
- MR. KELLY: -- beyond it -- that, would

- 1 Monthly Meeting 1-18-2018
- 2 --.
- 3 COMMISSIONER BURMAN: And when we will
- 4 make that determination?
- 5 MR. KELLY: So, the order requires Staff
- 6 to make a proposal, I believe by May 1st. That would
- 7 then go out for public comment, so some time -- I don't
- 8 have the dates on me, for the -- the -- when the
- 9 public-comment process -- April 30th, actually, but
- 10 some time by late summer, or early fall at the latest,
- 11 that would be ready for a Commission decision.
- 12 COMMISSIONER BURMAN: Okay. So, there
- 13 seems to be concern that there is potentially a cost-
- 14 shifting problem and that we have to account for that
- 15 and that we have to worry about the non-participating
- 16 customers, is that fair to say?
- 17 MR. KELLY: Yes.
- 18 COMMISSIONER BURMAN: Okay. And that
- 19 because of that, we are trying to figure out what the
- 20 right balance is, is that fair --
- MR. KELLY: Yes.
- 22 COMMISSIONER BURMAN: -- to say?
- Okay. So, that this is looking at now,
- 24 trying to forecast that and figure out what the right
- 25 information should be for Tranche Four and then for

- 1 Monthly Meeting 1-18-2018
- 2 potentially Tranche Five and what it means for each
- 3 service territory and potentially moving away from it
- 4 in Orange & Rockland and moving to a statewide program,
- 5 so that some of the utilities that are hardest hit,
- 6 Central Hudson and Orange & Rockland, cannot have it
- 7 continue to penetrate because the penetration is
- 8 potentially an issue.
- 9 MR. KELLY: I think penetrate -- I think
- 10 it's an issue on the potential cost-shift side. It's
- 11 not an issue on the -- sometimes penetration is spoken
- of as an issue, in terms of system impact, impact on
- 13 the energy system and we don't have any concerns about
- 14 that, at this time. But -- but on the potential cost-
- 15 shift side, yes.
- 16 COMMISSIONER BURMAN: Okay. The concern
- 17 I have is that I continually have felt that we are
- 18 doing a delicate dance of -- of being unwilling to
- 19 admit that we may have a problem in a -- going from
- 20 net-metering to value-D and the transition of that and
- 21 what that means for when we lift and completely get rid
- 22 of net-metering and the grandfathering issue.
- Back in October '15 -- 2015, when we had
- 24 an order establishing interim ceilings on the
- 25 interconnection of net-metered generation, I dissented

- 1 Monthly Meeting 1-18-2018
- 2 at that time. That was when we -- when the Commission,
- 3 at that time, lifted temporarily, the net-metering caps
- 4 and at that time, I was very concerned about what I
- 5 felt was -- that we needed to really take a hard look
- 6 and I'm going to read my dissent because I believe
- 7 strongly that many of the words in my dissent apply
- 8 today.
- 9 I strongly believe in the vision of New
- 10 York's Reforming Energy Vision. I understand that we
- 11 need to work together to enable self-sustaining clean-
- 12 energy markets at scale and build a cleaner, more
- 13 resilient and affordable energy system.
- 14 The achievement of our goals will not
- 15 happen overnight. I believe that the majority opinion
- 16 is made in a good-faith effort to have stability, while
- 17 still working on achieving our REV goals. In fact, the
- 18 majority position of not disrupting the distributed-
- 19 generation development efforts, is one I support.
- I'm also in agreement that REV should
- 21 ultimately decide alternatives to net-metering.
- However, we are in disagreement on what
- 23 to do during this transition and if this decision
- 24 actually achieves for the short- and long-term, a more
- 25 stable, sustainable energy system.

- 1 Monthly Meeting 1-18-2018
- 2 Moreover, I do not believe that this
- 3 decision today is a true, transitional approach. In
- 4 fact, the decision may invite uncertainty and confusion
- 5 in the implementation of net-metering and
- 6 unintentionally cause long-term harm to the goals we're
- 7 trying to achieve.
- 8 First, from an initial threshold matter,
- 9 we do not have a robust and transparent formal
- 10 notification. And it goes on and I -- I don't need to
- 11 continue with that because it gets in to the process
- 12 issues.
- 13 I do believe that -- that we're back to
- 14 the same issues though, where we -- we mean well, we're
- 15 trying to work through it, but that at the end of the
- 16 day, we need to do some more calculations on what this
- 17 means from penetration and also, whether or not we are
- 18 potentially not making some harder choices now and
- 19 also, looking at if we are going to again, look at now
- 20 taking this statewide, it goes back to that Public
- 21 Service Law, Section 66, which I do believe that while
- 22 we may have gotten away from it by moving away from it
- 23 to a value stack, it still goes back to the same basic
- 24 tenant of the Public Service Law. I do believe my
- 25 dissent of questioning whether or not we had gone too

- 1 Monthly Meeting 1-18-2018
- 2 far and exceeded our legal authority, is still as valid
- 3 today as it was then and just because the petition for
- 4 rehearing was withdrawn, doesn't mean that there's
- 5 still not some basic principles on whether or not that
- 6 was in fact exceeding it.
- 7 I do think that we can work together to
- 8 get to a good point and I do think that we need to work
- 9 through that. I am concerned that just like last time,
- 10 we are not making hard decisions now that we need to.
- 11 So, some of these decisions that are looking forward to
- 12 handle it later, need to be more finely-tuned now and
- is just adding to more confusion.
- I am not sure that going to the
- 15 statewide application is necessarily the answer, but I
- 16 do think that we need to look carefully. I think we
- 17 need to look in to each territory and work with the
- 18 utilities and all the stakeholders and most
- 19 importantly, the customers and work on holistically
- 20 what's there. And I think we can do that.
- 21 So, I am going to vote for this item, to
- 22 show my support for getting there, but I am raising a
- 23 red flag that we need to work together and get back to
- 24 the four corners of what the intent was with that and
- 25 also, be more diligent about focusing on the cost. We

- 1 Monthly Meeting 1-18-2018
- 2 are now admitting that there is a potential cost-
- 3 shifting and we also are now admitting what we were not
- 4 admitting back in October 2015, when I said it at
- 5 session, that there was problems for the non-
- 6 participating customers. So, in some ways, this is
- 7 admitting what I was alone with back in 2015.
- 8 So, with that, I do think that it shows
- 9 that for us, we are together in solving the issue and
- 10 so, that's why I will be supportive.
- 11 Thank you.
- 12 CHAIRMAN RHODES: Thank you very much.
- 13 Commissioner Alesi?
- 14 COMMISSIONER ALESI: I'm in favor,
- 15 nothing to add.
- 16 CHAIRMAN RHODES: Thank you.
- 17 We will now proceed to -- I will -- I
- 18 will now proceed to call for a vote on item 202.
- 19 My vote is in favor of the
- 20 recommendation to improve implementation of Tranche
- 21 Four, as described.
- Commissioner Sayre, how do you vote?
- 23 COMMISSIONER SAYRE: Aye.
- 24 CHAIRMAN RHODES: Commissioner Burman,
- 25 how do you vote?

13

Page 30

- 1 Monthly Meeting - 1-18-2018 2 COMMISSIONER BURMAN: Aye. 3 CHAIRMAN RHODES: Commissioner Alesi, 4 how do you vote? COMMISSIONER ALESI: Yes. 5 6 CHAIRMAN RHODES: The item is approved and the recommendation is adopted. 8 We will now move to the consent agenda. 9 Do any of my fellow Commissioners wish to recuse from voting on or comment on any item or 10 items on the consent agenda? 11 Seeing none, I will now proceed to call 12
- 14 My vote is in favor of the
- 15 recommendations on the consent agenda.

for a vote on the consent agenda.

- 16 Commissioner Sayre, how do you vote?
- 17 COMMISSIONER SAYRE: Aye.
- 18 CHAIRMAN RHODES: Commissioner Burman,
- 19 how do you vote?
- 20 COMMISSIONER BURMAN: Aye.
- 21 CHAIRMAN RHODES: Commissioner Alesi,
- 22 how do you vote?
- COMMISSIONER ALESI: Yes.
- 24 CHAIRMAN RHODES: The items are approved
- 25 and the recommendations are adopted.

```
1
                      Monthly Meeting - 1-18-2018
 2
                    Secretary Burgess, is there anything
 3
     further to come before us today?
                    SECRETARY BURGESS: There's nothing
 4
 5
     further to come before you today.
                    The next Commission meeting is February
 6
 7
     22nd at ten-thirty, in Albany.
 8
                    CHAIRMAN RHODES: Thank you, very much.
 9
                    With that, we are adjourned.
10
     (The meeting adjourned)
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

```
Monthly Meeting - 1-18-2018
 1
 2
     STATE OF NEW YORK
 3
     I, HANNAH ALLEN, do hereby certify that the foregoing was
     reported by me, in the cause, at the time and place, as
 4
 5
     stated in the caption hereto, at Page 1 hereof; that the
     foregoing typewritten transcription consisting of pages 1
 6
     through 31, is a true record of all proceedings had at the
 7
     hearing.
 8
                   IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto
 9
10
     subscribed my name, this the 23rd day of January, 2018.
11
12
13
     HANNAH ALLEN, Reporter
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

```
alternatives 26:21
                Α
                                  American 2:14
a.m1:13
                                  amount 22:5
ability 21:2,2
                                  analysis 18:12,23 19:5 23:9
able 8:9
                                  Analyst 2:20
Access 2:21
                                  animate 19:17
account 19:12 24:14
                                  answer 28:15
achieve 14:9 27:7
                                  appealing 14:14
achievement 26:14
                                  appears 14:12
achieves 26:24
                                  application 28:15
achieving 26:17
                                  applications 7:13
action 22:17,19
                                  applied 16:20
actions 10:16,17
                                  apply 26:7
activity 18:13
                                  approach 7:16,16 22:4 27:3
add 29:15
                                  approaches 5:22
adding 28:13
                                  appropriate 4:12 21:14
additional 21:22
                                  approve 6:5 14:21 21:5
addresses 3:3
                                  approved 6:20 7:4 15:8 30:6,24
adheres 6:2
                                  April 3:10 6:21 24:9
adjourned 31:9,10
                                  area 22:2
administratively 17:21 18:10
                                  Assistant 2:22 15:13
 22:5
                                  associated 18:8
administrator 3:5,21 4:10
                                  assumptions 23:13
admit 25:19
                                  auction 17:22 18:3,5,8 21:24
admitting 29:2,3,4,7
                                  auctions 18:3
adopt 8:9
                                  August 17:14
adopted 15:9 30:7,25
                                  authority 28:2
advancing 20:22
                                  authorizations 3:9
advisory 8:19,21 10:8
                                  authorize 3:19
advocate 10:24,24
                                  available 2:23 5:13 14:6 20:5
affordable 26:13
                                    20:16 21:24 23:4
agencies 10:17
                                  avoid 19:23
agency 1:14 4:7
                                  Aye 14:25 29:23 30:2,17,20
agenda 2:7,10,17 30:8,11,13,15
aggregates 3:16
aggregation 2:19 3:4 5:22 9:6
                                  B1:18
 9:13 14:22
                                  back 5:19 8:22 10:2,11 25:23
agreed 10:14 18:2,5
                                    27:13,20,23 28:23 29:4,7
agreement 21:7 26:20
                                  background 3:10
ahead 21:21
                                  balance 21:10,14 22:6 24:20
aims 3:12
                                  based 12:15,21 16:8 18:11,11,23
Al 2:21
                                    19:5,11
Albany 1:15 31:7
                                  basic 27:23 28:5
Alch 2:21 11:14,24 12:4
                                  Basing 20:23
Alesi1:20 13:22,23 15:5,7
                                  basis 3:17 11:19
 29:13,14 30:3,5,21,23
                                  becoming 6:8
ALLEN 32:3,13
                                  beginning 9:11
allocations 16:23 19:10,16 20:3
                                  behalf 3:19
allowed 22:16
                                  believe 7:10,15 24:6 26:6,9,15
alternative 21:17
                                    27:2,13,21,24
```

```
benefits 18:9
                                  Chair's 21:8
better 9:3
                                  Chairman 2:2,15 5:15 6:17 13:21
beyond 17:15 23:16, 19, 25
                                   14:16,17 15:2,5,8 20:18 22:7
billing8:7
                                   29:12,16,24 30:3,6,18,21,24
board 13:17
                                   31:8
                                  change 2:10
bolstering 14:10
                                  changed 11:25
bring 10:2
Bruce 2:21,21 11:11
                                  changes 2:6 7:5
build19:19 26:12
                                  charges 2:13
Building 1:14
                                  Chief 2:21
built 16:2
                                  choice 3:13 6:12 12:25 14:22
burden 21:12
                                   21:20
Burgess 2:6,8 31:2,4
                                  choices 5:24 27:18
Burman 1:19 6:18,19 8:11 11:20
                                  clarity 20:25
 12:3,5,13 13:3 15:2,4 22:8,9
                                  clean 6:13 21:16
 22:18,20 23:8,15,21,24 24:3
                                  clean-26:11
 24:12,18,22 25:16 29:24 30:2
                                  clean-energy 21:11
 30:18,20
                                  cleaner 26:12
business 14:10
                                  clear 11:12 21:23
businesses 3:17 14:7 16:4
                                  climate 14:10
buy-utility 16:19
                                  close 18:16,21
buyer's 12:8,21,24
                                  closed 18:19,20
                                  cognizant 10:18 13:10,13
                С
                                  combination 6:13
C1:19
                                  come 8:22 10:11 13:19 31:3,5
calculations 27:16
                                  comes 7:17
call 2:3 14:18 29:18 30:12
                                  coming 9:22 13:12
capacity 16:19 17:9,17 18:17,21
                                  comma 2:14
 19:10,15 20:3
                                  comment 24:7 30:10
caps 20:3 26:3
                                  commenters 18:2,5,9
caption 32:5
                                  comments 4:9 17:23,23,24 21:8
carefully 13:11 28:16
                                   21:23
case 2:11,18 9:15,23 11:13
                                  commercial 11:2
 15:11 18:6
                                  Commission 1:2,9 2:4,12 3:11,22
cause 27:6 32:4
                                   7:17 8:18,23 9:19 10:3,5,11
causing 19:17
                                   13:19 15:19 16:22 17:21 22:17
cautious 9:25
                                   22:22 23:6 24:11 26:2 31:6
CBG 17:3
                                  Commission's 4:17 19:12
CCA 3:9, 12, 15, 19, 21, 23, 24 4:5, 6
                                  Commissioner 6:6,7,18,19 8:11
 4:10,16 5:9 6:3,7 7:21 11:9
                                   11:20 12:3,5,13 13:3,22,23
CCAC 7:21 10:6,7
                                   14:24,25 15:2,4,5,7 21:6,7
CCAs 6:10
                                   22:8,9,18,20 23:8,15,21,24
CDG 21:17
                                   24:3,12,18,22 25:16 29:13,14
ceilings 25:24
                                   29:22,23,24 30:2,3,5,16,17,18
Central 17:5,8 18:17,19 19:4
                                   30:20,21,23
 20:2 21:18 25:6
                                  Commissioners 1:17 2:9 3:2
Certainly 23:20
                                    15:16 30:9
certifications 3:8
                                  communications 4:3
certify 32:3
                                  communities 5:23
Chair1:18 2:8,25 15:16 21:22
```

```
community 8:6 16:6
                                  councils 8:19
community-14:21
                                  Counsel 2:22 15:13
community-choice 2:19 3:4 5:21
                                  Couple 7:18
 9:6,13
                                  coupled 16:11
community-distributed 16:5
                                  create 2:19
                                  created 17:16 18:15
Company 2:14
compensation 15:20 16:9,12,12
                                  credit16:7 17:17,20 20:5
 16:14,15 19:2,3,7,8 20:10,22
                                  cust 16:21
 20:24
                                  customer 4:13,23 6:11,12
competitive 18:3
                                  customer-account 4:22
completely 10:14 25:21
                                  customers 4:6 9:20,23 11:2,5,8
compliance 5:11 11:5
                                    11:16 15:24 16:3,4 20:25
                                    21:13 24:16 28:19 29:6
complies 4:16 14:2
component 6:4
                                                  D
concept 12:9
                                  dance 25:18
concern 9:7 10:2,10 24:13 25:16
                                  data-protect 4:20
concerned 8:18 26:4 28:9
                                  data-protection 3:7 4:24 14:23
concerns 4:6 8:12 25:13
                                  dates 24:8
concludes 5:12
                                  day 27:16 32:10
conducted 18:23
confirm 5:7
                                  days 5:4 8:25
confusion 27:4 28:13
                                  deal 10:15 21:21
                                  decide 12:19 26:21
conjunction 14:8
connected 10:4
                                  decided 21:21
                                  decision 23:5 24:11 26:23 27:3
consent 30:8, 11, 13, 15
                                    27:4
consider 20:12
                                  decisions 28:10,11
consideration 3:22 19:13
                                  decline 17:20 18:11
considerations 10:3 13:18
consistent 4:21 17:9 19:21
                                  default 12:2
                                  definition 4:23
consisting 32:6
                                  degree 9:17
consolidated 8:6
                                  delay 20:8
consumer 3:13 10:24
                                  delicate 25:18
consumers 5:8
                                  demonstration 11:18
contact 4:4,8,23
                                  depend 23:19
contain 23:13
                                  deploy 21:2
contained 17:14
                                  deployment 3:14 5:21
continually 25:17
                                  DER 3:18 15:18
continue 5:8 7:9 15:25 19:17
                                  described 11:14 14:23 29:21
 25:7 27:11
continued 5:21 17:10 22:15
                                  description 4:2
                                  design 16:8
contracts 4:14
control 5:23
                                  designed 16:8, 11, 14, 17 18:25
                                    19:6,16
corners 28:24
                                  details 4:13 9:8
Correct 22:18
                                  determination 24:4
cost 21:4 28:25
cost-23:10 24:13 25:14 29:2
                                  develop 20:10
cost-shift 25:10
                                  developers 19:19 20:24
                                  development 2:22 3:12 17:25
cost-shifting 23:9
                                    22:3 26:19
costs14:4 18:7 19:21
                                  devil 9:8
```

```
devils 9:7
                                    12:9,15,17,23 14:3,21 20:23
DG 8:6
                                    21:16 25:13 26:10,12,13,25
DIANE 1:19
                                  Energy's 4:16
different 11:8 12:8
                                  engaged 9:21
diligent 28:25
                                  engagement 7:11
directed 15:20
                                  engaging 13:14
                                  English-proficiency 5:8
directly 10:4 13:15
                                  ensure 4:25
directs 20:8
disagreement 9:17 10:9 26:22
                                  equal 16:12,14
discouraged 22:3
                                  ESCO 11:9
discrepancy 11:13
                                  ESCOS 11:8
discussed 17:19
                                  especially 10:12 13:6
discussion 2:17 9:18 15:11
                                  essentially 21:17 22:16
disputing 11:12
                                  established 3:11 6:2
disrupting 26:18
                                  establishes 18:24 19:5
dissent 26:6,7 27:25
                                  establishing 25:24
dissented 6:21 9:5 25:25
                                  estimates 23:12
distinction 11:7
                                  examining 7:3,8
distinctions 12:15
                                  example 16:6 23:6
distinguish 11:11
                                  exceeded 17:8 28:2
distributed 3:15 6:14 15:20
                                  exceeding 28:6
distributed-20:22 26:18
                                  excuse 5:18
distributed-energy 15:12,17
                                  expensive 21:25
document 7:24
                                  explain 22:10
doing 7:12 25:18
                                  explicitly 12:17
                                  extent 8:24 9:19 10:6,13 11:6
don't8:2 11:10 24:7 25:13
 27:10
draft11:15 18:14,24 19:5,16
                                  fact 5:25 13:11 14:5,8,11 26:17
drafts 4:3
drilling 13:7
                                    27:4 28:6
                                  fair 24:16,20
Due 19:3
                                  fall 24:10
                                  far 28:2
early 24:10
                                  favor 14:20 29:14,19 30:14
easier 21:21
                                  February 31:6
Economic 2:22
                                  fellow 30:9
                                  felt 25:17 26:5
education 4:25 5:5
effective 18:4
                                  figure 24:19,24
effort 13:25 26:16
                                  file 4:11
efforts 14:3 26:19
                                  filed 3:3 7:23
                                  filing 5:11 7:20,21 11:5
eighty-five 17:4
either 18:10
                                  filings 3:6,21
element 8:6
                                  filled 20:11 22:11,14 23:3
embrace 14:2
                                  final 2:7,10 4:12
Empire 1:14
                                  find19:19 20:20,24 21:3
enable 26:11
                                  finds 4:15
encourage 19:19
                                  finely-tuned 28:12
                                  first2:4,17,17 16:9 27:8
ends 5:5
energy 2:19 3:4,6,14,15,18,22
                                  five 19:7,14 25:2
 4:22 5:6,24 6:13,14 7:14 8:9
                                  five-percent 18:11
```

```
flag 28:23
                                  group 7:21 9:16 10:8,24 12:8,24
flexibility 12:18
                                    16:9,13,15 19:24
Floor 1:14
                                  groups 8:13, 18, 19 12:21 20:14
focused 7:7 12:20 19:23 20:14
                                  guaranteed 11:17,22
focusing 28:25
                                                  Η
forecast 24:24
                                  handle 28:12
foregoing 32:3,6
                                  HANNAH 32:3,13
form 3:9
formal 27:9
                                  happen 22:21 26:15
formed 10:9
                                  happening 7:3
forward 8:4,10 28:11
                                  happens 22:10
four 15:12 17:25 18:7,10,15,25
                                  happy 6:10
                                  hard 13:5 20:3 21:9 26:5 28:10
 19:6,11,15 20:2,11 23:2,3,11
                                  harder 27:18
 24:25 28:24 29:21
fourth 17:16
                                  hardest 25:5
                                  harm 27:6
frame 3:24
                                  hearing 32:8
framework 3:11, 19, 24 4:17, 18
 6:21
                                  heavily 9:20
                                  helpful 9:3
frankly 9:2 10:17
                                  hereof 32:5
frequently 6:12
                                  hereto 32:5
full 18:22,22
fully 7:7 14:2
                                  hereunto 32:9
                                  highest 19:20
funding 10:15 20:12 23:7
                                  hit 25:5
further 17:20 18:11,12 19:23
                                  holistic 7:16
 20:5,13 22:17,19 31:3,5
                                  holistically 28:19
future 21:17
                                  Hudson 17:5,8 18:18,19 19:4
                                    20:2 25:6
general 4:17 18:4
                                  Hudson's 21:18
generation 15:21 16:5 25:25
                                                   Ι
 26:19
                                  idea 12:20
generic 3:7
getting 28:22
                                  ideas 14:3
                                  identification 4:7
given 18:6 23:4
                                  immediate 18:20
gives 20:24
                                  immediately 18:18,20 20:9
glad 6:8
go10:4 21:21 23:16 24:7
                                  impact 9:20 19:18 20:13 25:12
goals 4:2 19:21 26:14,17 27:6
                                    25:12
                                   impacts 16:18 19:23
goes 27:10,20,23
                                  implementation 3:7,25 4:11,19
going 8:3,4 13:25 22:21 25:19
                                    4:24 5:7 8:5 12:9 14:22 27:5
 26:6 27:19 28:14,21
                                    29:20
good 2:2,8,18,25 3:4,6,22 4:15
 4:22 5:6 7:14 8:9 12:9,15,17
                                  important 14:7
                                   importantly 28:19
 12:22 13:14,24 14:21 15:16
                                  improve 7:9 29:20
 21:21 22:6 28:8
                                  improvements 7:13 13:16
good-faith 26:16
                                  include 3:6,25 6:12
gotten 27:22
                                  including 4:4,12 17:20 20:23
grandfathering 25:22
                                  incorporate 6:24 7:10
greater 5:23
GREGG 1:19
                                  incorporated 7:23,24 8:3
```

increase 3:12 19:13 21:16 latest 24:10 increased 6:11 Law 27:21,24 increasing 21:10 layman's 22:10 incremental 19:18 21:12 learned 6:23 legal 28:2 incrementally 7:5 **legislative** 9:14 10:17 information 4:5,23 9:2,4 24:25 initial 19:4 27:8 lessons 6:23 **letter** 4:4 17:5,13 initiate 3:23 integration 8:5 **letters** 4:13 17:7 intent 28:24 level 17:2,4,18,20 23:22 liaison 4:5 interconnection 25:25 interest 6:15 20:22 21:10 life 5:9 lift 25:21 interested 3:19 12:16 interim 25:24 lifted 26:3 limit 17:9 19:13 interpretation 12:24 intrigued 14:5 limited 5:7 invite 27:4 **limits** 16:19 involved 7:20 little 12:18 issue 10:10,21,25 12:7 25:8,10 load 3:16 local 3:14 4:7 25:11,12,22 29:9 **issued** 8:25 15:19 locations 19:20 issues 8:8 9:10 11:21 13:8,16 long-term 26:24 27:6 **look** 6:24 9:9 13:11 21:9 26:5 27:12,14 item 2:11,11,17,18 3:3 5:17,20 27:19 28:16,17 5:25 6:16 8:24 9:24 13:10 looking 7:5 13:14,17 24:23 14:19 15:8,10,11 20:20 21:9 27:19 28:11 21:13,20 22:4 28:21 29:18 lose 14:8 30:6,10 lot 7:11 8:4 9:2,9,17 13:7,7 items 9:6 10:5,13,15 30:11,24 23:13 low-income 11:5,7,8,16 14:13 J **lower** 14:4 19:4 **JAMES** 1:20 lowest 19:21 **January** 1:13 16:2 32:10 **LP's** 14:21 **JOHN** 1:18 join 13:2 majority 26:15,18 K making 7:12 8:22 9:3 27:18 **Kelly** 2:20,22,24 5:16 7:19 28:10 12:11,14 13:6 15:13,15 22:12 **manage** 16:18 22:19,23 23:10,17,22,25 24:5 March 15:19 17:9 22:13 24:17,21 25:9 market18:12 19:17 20:7 kind 12:20,23,24 14:12 market-transition 16:7 17:17,19 know 6:20 7:19 8:25 9:3,4,8,22 20:5 11:10 13:4,6 23:12,20 markets 26:12 mass-market 15:24 16:3 L master 3:6 **laid** 4:18 matches 8:20 laser 7:7 matter 27:8 Lastly 5:6 mean 13:17 27:14 28:4 **late** 24:10 means 25:2,21 27:17

```
mechanism 23:7
                                  NEM 16:12,15 19:2,7
mechanisms 15:23 18:4 20:13
                                  net-metered 25:25
meet 22:25
                                  net-metering 15:21,25 16:9
meeting1:1,9 2:1 3:1 4:1 5:1
                                   25:20,22 26:3,21 27:5
 6:1 7:1 8:1 9:1 10:1 11:1
                                  new 1:2,15 2:11,13 3:5 5:23
 12:1 13:1 14:1 15:1 16:1 17:1
                                   6:11 9:13 12:9 14:9 15:21
 18:1 19:1 20:1 21:1 22:1 23:1
                                   20:6 21:11 22:3,23 23:5,5
 24:1 25:1 26:1 27:1 28:1 29:1
                                   26:9 32:2
 30:1 31:1,6,10 32:1
                                  ninety 16:17
meets 4:17
                                  ninety-five 16:14
Mega 4:21 7:4,14 12:12,19
                                  non-16:18 21:12 29:5
megawatts 19:14
                                  non-participating 19:18 24:15
met 22:24
                                  non-residential 14:6
methodology 15:22
                                  note 10:22
mic 5:19
                                  notification 16:21 17:2,5,13
milestone 22:24 23:2
                                   27:10
                                  November 17:6
minimal 19:17 23:11
minimizing 21:4
                                  number 4:22 7:3 8:12 17:23
minor 4:19 12:14
                                  NYSEG 18:18,21 19:4
model 6:2 12:12
                                  NYSERDA 18:24 20:10
modest 21:15
                                                  0
Monthly1:1 2:1 3:1 4:1 5:1 6:1
                                  O&R 17:3,7 18:17,19,25 20:2
 7:1 8:1 9:1 10:1 11:1 12:1
 13:1 14:1 15:1 16:1 17:1 18:1
                                  O&R's 21:18
 19:1 20:1 21:1 22:1 23:1 24:1
                                  obligation 9:22 11:15
                                  occurring 5:22
 25:1 26:1 27:1 28:1 29:1 30:1
 31:1 32:1
                                  October 25:23 29:4
                                  official 4:7
more-flexible 12:23
                                  Okay 11:14 12:3 13:3 24:12,18
morning 2:2,8,25 13:24 15:16
motion 2:12
                                   24:23 25:16
                                  on-site 15:24 17:2
move 15:10 30:8
                                  once 20:4,11 21:21 23:3
moving 8:9, 13, 14, 20 17:15 25:3
 25:4 27:22
                                  ongoing 11:7
MTC 16:7,8,10,13,16,20 18:10,25
                                  open 12:19
                                  operated 12:16
 19:6 23:4
                                  operating 8:16 12:17
MTCs 19:4,15
                                  opinion 26:15
municipal 3:8 12:25,25
                                  opportunity 5:24 14:13
municipalities 3:5, 16, 20 12:18
                                  opt-out 3:17 4:4,13 5:3
 13:2
                                  options 17:14,19
municipality 4:8
                                  Orange 25:4,6
               N
                                  order 2:5 3:19,25 4:17,18,21
name 32:10
                                   10:9 11:15 15:19,24 17:9
names 15:19
                                   18:14,24 19:5,16 20:8 22:13
necessarily 8:16 10:13 28:15
                                   22:17 24:5 25:24
need 5:6 7:15 8:7,22 9:18,21,25
                                  orders 6:3
 10:2,11,18 13:11,18 26:11
                                  outcome 20:21
27:10,16 28:8,10,12,16,17,23
                                  outreach 4:3,25 5:4
needed 4:20 18:12 26:5
                                  outside 9:14
needing 10:16
                                  overall 7:9 14:9 21:16
```

```
overflow 22:16
                                  problems 29:5
overnight 26:15
                                  proceed 2:16 14:18 29:17,18
overwhelm 18:8
                                   30:12
                                  proceeding 2:12
                                  proceedings 32:7
Page 32:5
                                  process 6:7 9:15 13:14 17:22
pages 32:6
                                   21:25 24:9 27:11
Paper 17:13, 15, 18, 24
                                  procurement 18:4
participating 16:5, 19 21:13
                                  procures 3:18
                                  program 2:20 3:15,23 4:14,16
participation 3:13
                                   5:10 6:25 7:4,22 14:22 25:4
particular 19:24
                                  programs 3:12 21:12
particularly 14:5
                                  project 22:3
partner 12:19
                                  project-size 19:13
penetrate 25:7,9
                                  projects 16:2,6,10,13,16 17:2,3
penetration 25:7,11 27:17
                                   17:10 19:20 20:6,14 21:18
people 14:13
                                   22:14,24 23:5
percent 16:15,17,22 17:4 19:2,2
                                  proposal 6:4 15:13 20:10 23:7
 19:7,8 23:14,14
                                   24:6
percentage 17:20
                                  proposed 4:16 18:7
period 5:2,3,3,5
                                  protection 3:8 4:20 14:12
petition 2:18 3:3 28:3
                                  protective 14:12
phrasing 11:10
                                  provide 4:13 6:11 14:3,11 16:11
pilot 6:22,23 7:4,8,9
                                   16:14,16,17 18:25 19:7 21:15
pilots 13:12
                                  provided 5:10
pivotal 7:3
                                  provides 12:18
place 5:2 32:4
                                  providing 5:23
placed 22:15, 25 23:2
                                  public 1:2,9 2:4 6:15 10:2
placing 17:10
                                   21:10 24:7 27:20,24
plan 3:7,8,25 4:2,3,12,20,20,24
                                  public-4:2
 4:24 5:7 8:3 12:10 14:22,23
                                  public-comment 24:9
planning 3:14
                                  put 17:13
Plaza 1:14
                                                  0
please 2:24 15:14
point 28:8
                                  quarter 23:14
                                  questioning 27:25
points 7:3
                                  questions 2:23 4:5,9 5:13 7:18
policy 10:3,16 13:18
                                   20:17
position 26:18
positively 7:8
potential 4:6 7:5 13:15 16:18
 25:10,14 29:2
                                  raise 10:8,10,25 11:6
                                  raised 10:20
potentially 3:18 10:16 24:13
 25:2,3,8 27:18
                                  raising 28:22
                                  ratepayers 16:19 19:18,24,25
presentation 5:12
                                   20:15 21:4
presented 2:20 15:13
preserves 20:25
                                  rates 2:13
                                  reached 16:24,25 17:4,8 18:16
preserving 20:21
                                   20:4
principles 19:22 28:5
                                  reaches 18:20
prior 6:2,3
                                  reaching 18:16
problem 24:14 25:19
```

```
read 26:6
                                  resource 21:3
ready 24:11
                                  resources 3:15 6:14 15:12,18
really 6:8 26:5
                                    20:23 21:11
reasons 9:5
                                  respond 4:5
receive 5:8 15:25 16:6,10
                                  Retail 2:21
                                  REV19:22 26:17,20
received 16:13,16 17:24
receiving 17:12
                                  reverse 21:24
                                  review 4:15
recognize 9:5
recommendation 14:21 15:9 29:20
                                  revisions 4:19 5:10
                                  Rhodes 1:18 2:2,15,25 5:15 6:17
recommendations 7:25 8:4,22
                                    13:21 14:17 15:2,5,8 20:18
 17:14 30:15,25
                                    22:7 29:12,16,24 30:3,6,18,21
recommended 17:16,22 18:9
                                    30:24 31:8
recommends 18:15
                                  rid 25:21
                                  right 8:3 11:10,20 12:5 22:20
record 32:7
recuse 30:10
                                    23:21,24 24:20,24
red 28:23
                                  risk 18:7
                                  risks 18:8
reduced 17:17
reduction 19:3,8
                                  robust 27:9
refined 12:10
                                  Rockland 25:4,6
Reforming 26:10
                                  roles 8:21
                                  roof-top 15:25 17:2
regular 2:16
regulations 2:13
                                  rounded 19:12
rehearing 28:4
                                  routine 6:8
reiterate 13:9
                                  rules 2:13
related 7:18
                                                  S
relatively 18:6,21 19:25 21:25
                                  s1:20
 23:11
remarks 20:19
                                  savings 5:24 6:12 11:18,19,22
remove 4:22
                                  Sayer 21:6
                                  Sayre 1:19 6:6,7 14:24,25 21:7
renewable 6:3
                                    29:22,23 30:16,17
renewal 13:12
                                  scale 26:12
reply 17:23
                                  second 15:10 16:12 21:20
report 7:22 8:25 9:9 10:6
                                  Secretary 2:6,8 31:2,4
report's 8:3
                                  Section 27:21
reported 32:4
                                  see 6:8,10
Reporter 32:13
                                  Seeing 30:12
reporting 11:18
reports 10:4
                                  selected 3:20
                                  self-sustaining 26:11
represents 20:21
                                  series 3:21
required 3:25 4:10 21:9
requirements 4:18 11:17
                                  serve 3:4 11:16
                                  service1:2,9 2:4,14 14:3 25:3
requires 24:5
                                    27:21,24
requiring 21:23
                                  services 3:18 5:9
requisite 11:18
                                  session 2:3,4 29:5
residential 16:4 19:25
residents 3:17 4:4,8
                                  set 17:21 18:10,10 21:24
                                  sets 22:4
resilient 26:13
                                  setting 17:19
resolved 8:8
                                  seven 9:12
```

```
submitting 17:7
severely 22:2
shift 25:15
                                  subscribed 32:10
shifting 23:11 24:14 29:3
                                  subsequently 22:25
short 9:22
                                  successes 13:15
short-26:24
                                  successful 7:12
show 28:22
                                  successfully 8:14,15
showcases 9:10
                                  summer 17:5 24:10
shows 29:8
                                  supplements 4:11
shutting 21:17
                                  support 6:16 9:24 21:16,19,24
                                    22:5 26:19 28:22
side 25:10,15
sight 14:8
                                  supported 17:25
significant 9:18
                                  supporting 3:14 13:25 14:15
similar 12:12 17:18 18:3
                                    21:11
simply 21:19
                                  supportive 29:10
                                  sure 22:12 23:17 28:14
size 18:7
small 3:17 9:16 14:6 16:4 18:6
                                  sustainable 26:25
 19:25 20:14 22:2
                                  system 25:12,13 26:13,25
solar 15:25 16:6 20:23 21:3
sole 10:23
                                  take 5:2 26:5
solving 29:9
somewhat 12:12
                                  talk 11:2
                                  talks 11:4
specifically 18:17 20:12
                                  tandem 8:16
spoken 25:11
                                  Ted 2:22 15:13,14 20:18 21:22
stability 26:16
                                  temporarily 26:3
stable 26:25
                                  ten-thirty 31:7
stack 15:21 16:8,11 27:23
                                  tenant 27:24
Staff 4:15 17:13 18:24 20:9
 24:5
                                  tenure 8:17
                                  terms 22:10,13 25:12
Staff's 23:6
                                  territories 12:21 20:2 21:18
stakeholders 7:11,20 9:15,16
                                  territory 20:4,11 25:3 28:17
 10:14 20:9 28:18
                                  thank 2:15 5:14,15 6:17,19 12:5
stand-alone 7:13 11:9
                                    13:4,20,21,23 14:17 15:15
starting 6:10,22,24
state1:2,14 3:6 5:22,23 9:14
                                    20:16,18 22:7 29:11,12,16
                                    31:8
 14:10 32:2
                                  things 7:8 8:6 9:20 10:3 11:4
stated 32:5
                                  think 8:2 12:11,17 14:2,7 21:13
statements 11:25
                                    22:5 25:9,9 28:7,8,16,16,20
states 9:12 12:16
statewide 6:20,24 7:10 20:12
                                    29:8
 23:7 25:4 27:20 28:15
                                  third 16:15 23:13
Strait 2:20,25 8:2
                                  thirty 5:4
strikes 21:13 22:6
                                  thoughtful 20:21
                                  Three 1:14 16:16 17:9,11,15,18
strongly 26:7,9
                                    18:17,18,19 19:3,9,11 22:10
sub-group 9:16 10:7,22
sub-groups 8:13
                                   22:14,15,25
                                  threshold 27:8
sub-working 7:21
sub-zones 12:22
                                  thrive 6:11
subjected 20:7
                                  Thursday 1:13
                                  time 6:21 7:2 9:9 13:12,13 24:7
submitted 17:4
                                    24:10 25:14 26:2,3,4 28:9
```

```
32:4
                                  versus 11:9
today 18:14 26:8 27:3 28:3 31:3
                                  vision 26:9,10
 31:5
                                  voluntary 7:22 12:25
                                  vote 6:5 14:18,20,24 15:3,6,7
top 16:7
total 19:2,8
                                    21:5 28:21 29:18,19,22,25
total-capacity 16:23
                                    30:4,13,14,16,19,22
tranche 15:12 16:10,13,16,20
                                  votes 22:22
 17:8,10,15,16,18,25 18:7,10
                                  voting10:5 13:10 30:10
 18:15,17,18,19,25 19:3,6,8,10
                                                  W
 19:11,15 20:2,11 21:22 22:10
                                  want 10:18,25 11:6,12 12:19
 22:14,15,23,25 23:2,3,11
                                    13:9
 24:25 25:2 29:20
                                  wants 13:2
tranches 16:23 17:3
                                  water 2:14,14
transcription 32:6
                                  way 3:10
transition 15:20 25:20 26:23
transitional 15:23 27:3
                                  ways 29:6
                                  we'll 2:16 15:10
translation 5:9
                                  we're11:7 14:9 22:14 27:6,13
transparent 27:9
                                    27:14
treating 11:8
                                  we've 7:5 12:10
true 27:3 32:7
trying 14:9 24:19,24 27:7,15
                                  week 7:20
two 6:2 8:25 16:13
                                  weigh-in 8:23 10:18
                                  weighing 9:19
two-month 5:2
                                  welcome 5:17,17,20,20,25 6:3
typewritten 32:6
                                    20:20
                U
                                  went 23:19,23
UIU10:24
                                  WHEREOF 32:9
ultimately17:21 26:21
                                  White 17:13, 15, 18, 24
uncertainty 20:8 27:4
                                  wish 30:9
understand 23:18 26:10
                                  withdrawn 28:4
unintentionally 27:6
                                  WITNESS 32:9
unreasonable 20:8
                                  wondering 7:22
unwieldy 21:25
                                  words 26:7
                                  work 20:25 26:11 27:15 28:7,8
unwilling 25:18
update 5:6
                                    28:17,19,23
updates 4:11
                                  working 8:12, 18, 20 13:4 20:9
utilities 17:10 18:15 19:6 25:5
                                    26:17
                                  worry 24:15
utility 2:20 12:2,22 16:21,22
                                  worse 12:2
16:25 19:11,25 20:4 23:4
                                  written 4:3
utility-service 12:21
                                                  X
                                  x1:19
valid 28:2
value 15:12, 17, 18, 21 16:7, 11
 20:24 27:23
                                  Yeah 12:13
value-D25:20
                                  year-end 11:19
values 19:20
                                  York 1:2,15 2:13 3:5 5:23 6:11
                                    9:13 14:9 32:2
VDER 15:18
                                  York's 26:10
versions 4:12
```

Page 44

	Page 44
	8
zone 12:22	85 16:22 19:7
0	9
1	
1 32:5,6	
1-18-2018 1:1 2:1 3:1 4:1 5:1	
6:1 7:1 8:1 9:1 10:1 11:1 12:1 13:1 14:1 15:1 16:1 17:1	
18:1 19:1 20:1 21:1 22:1 23:1	
24:1 25:1 26:1 27:1 28:1 29:1	
30:1 31:1 32:1	
10:30 1:13	
14-M-0224 2:18	
15 19:2 25:23 15-E-0751 15:11	
16-W-02592:11	
18 1:13	
19th 1:14	
1st 16:2 24:6	
201 2:18 3:3 14:19	
2015 25:23 29:4,7	
2016 3:11 6:21	
2018 1:13 2:4 32:10	
202 29:18 2020 16:2	
21st 3:10	
22nd 31:7	
23rd 32:10	
3	
31:14	
301 15:11	
30th 24:9	
31 32:7	
4	
461 2:11	
5	
6	
66 27:21	
7	
75 19:2	
	•